

Cinderella pneumatology as an intercultural discussion: personal, church, and theological experience sequence

Charstar Arstilo Rumbay 

Theologische Universiteit Apeldoorn, Netherlands

Correspondence:

crumbay@tua.nl

DOI:

<https://doi.org/10.30995/kur.v8i2.564>

Article History

Submitted: April 11, 2022

Reviewed: October 19, 2022

Accepted: October 26, 2022

Keywords:

experience sequence;

Indonesia culture;

intercultural;

pneumatology

Scan this QR,
Read Online



Abstract: Pneumatology shares a rich discussion of theology and its branches of knowledge. Indeed, intercultural discussion of the account receives attention but has no solid ground, where I borrow Moltmann's term, pneumatology as cinderella theology that is frequently left behind. Question of why intercultural discussion to pneumatology is one the forgotten question that needs more clarification. Further, its relation to the Indonesian context provokes curiosity about the tension. By using the qualitative-analysis method, this research attempts to gain knowledge concerning why pneumatological-intercultural discussion. In sum, personal, church, and theological experience encourage pneumatology to open access for intercultural discussion, specifically speaking, about the Indonesian context.

Copyright: ©2022, Authors.

License:



INTRODUCTION

Discussion, fluctuation, debate, and conversation on the discourse of the Spirit exist. Modern Christians consider it simply as a biblical studies issue or specifically speaking, a systematic theology concern. Indeed, it encompasses other issues and disciplines such as anthropological, social, religious, and cultural issues, but current studies do not perform confidently by claiming pneumatology as an intercultural discussion. Many academic works in intercultural pneumatology have been placed. Almir C. Brunetti shared Latin American pneumatology, where the Holy Spirit is one of the significant themes in religious and cultural events.¹ In the African context, Caleb Oladipo offered the development of pneumatology in the Yoruba African indigenous Christian movement and Marthinus L. Daneel proposed church Pneumatology in Africa.² Pneumatologies from the Asian branches; Yeow Choo Lak discussed

¹ Almir C. Brunetti, "The Feast of the Holy Spirit, An Exhibit," *The Latin American Library*, last modified 1996, <http://lal.tulane.edu/happenings/exhibits/feast-holy-spirit-exhibit>.

² M. L. Daneel, "AFRICAN INDEPENDENT CHURCH PNEUMATOLOGY AND THE SALVATION OF ALL CREATION," *International Review of Mission* 82, no. 326 (April 1993): 143–166, <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1758-6631.1993.tb02659.x>.

how to engage with the Spirit movement in Asia³ and Jung Young Lee described the number of Asian symbols and metaphors on spirits and its relation to the Holy Spirit.⁴ Explicitly speaking, in the Indonesian context, Charstar Rumbay portrayed the Spirit's personality to Minahasan context,⁵ I Ketut Suparta proposed the fluctuation on the word 'Spirit' in Balinese Bible,⁶ and Debora Butar-butur and Binsar Pakpahan offered trinitarian pneumatology as a theology of religions cornerstone.⁷ Yet, how pneumatology could be an intercultural discussion is a provoking question that needs more clarification in its absence.

Hwa Yung argues that Asian needs to contextualize Christian dogmas, to think of the revelation of God but in an Asian framework. Unfortunately, attention to this account is insufficient, and even a single adequate text does not prepare for this account. Most of the discourses on systematic-intercultural theology express Western context.⁸ Recently, several projects have existed. For instance, Fuchsia Pickett explores the personality of the Spirit with its divinity.⁹ Charles Ryrie evaluates the essential doctrine of the Spirit and focuses on the gifts, activities, and baptism of the Spirit.¹⁰ Daniel B. Wallace attempts to dig texts in the New Testament books and examines Greek grammar to gain a notion concerning the personality of the Spirit.¹¹ Specific work on the Spirit's personality has been placed by Andrew David Naselli and Philip R. Gons. They exercise the biblical approach and exegetical method to delve into texts in the New Testament; John 14:26, 15:26, and 16:13-14. They insist that the Spirit is truly a person and expresses masculine demonstration.¹² However, these authors intend to defend historical debates concerning the doctrine of the trinity and prove the existence of the Spirit as a real being rather than God's power. The question is, what is the significance of those works in a global context? Poverty, injustice, demon possession, ancestors' authority, economic inequality, ancient rituals, and the Spirit's personality that relate to the specific context, especially speaking the Indonesian present context do not receive attention. Eventually, how could pneumatology be an intercultural discussion?

³ Yeow Choo Lak, *Preface to "Doing Theology with the Spirit's Movement in Asia,"* Ed. John C. England and Alan J. Torrane, Singapore: ATESEA, 1991.

⁴ Jung Young Lee, *The Theology of Change: A Christian Concept of God in an Eastern Perspective*, Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1979.

⁵ Charstar Arstilo Rumbay, "Portraying the Spirit's Personality to Minahasan Christian with Its Ancestral Spirits Tradition Hues," *Religió: Jurnal Studi Agama-agama* 11, no. 1 (March 17, 2021): 114–130, <http://jurnalfuf.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/religio/article/view/1610>. I proposed pneumatological formula that relates to Minahasan's cosmological knowledge. By doing this, the Spirit is being precise in Minahasans spiritual experiences.

⁶ I Ketut Gede Suparta, "Penggunaan Kata Roh Sang Hyang Pengardi Sebagai Terjemahan Kata Roh Kudus Dalam Alkitab Bahasa Bali," *Jurnal Teologi Kontekstual Indonesia* 2, no. 2 (March 2, 2022): 27, <https://journal.sttsimpson.ac.id/index.php/JTKI/article/view/501>.

⁷ Rut Debora Butarbutur and Binsar Jonathan Pakpahan, "Konsep Trinitarian Pneumatologis Sebagai Landasan Teologi Agama-Agama," *Kurios: Jurnal Teologi dan Pendidikan Agama Kristen* 7, no. 2 (2021).

⁸ Hwa Yung, *Mangoes or Bananas? The Quest for an Authentic Asian Christian Theology*, Regnum Studies in Mission, Oxford: Regnum, 1997.

⁹ Fuchsia Pickett, *Understanding the Holy Spirit's Personality: The Holy Spirit's Work in You*, Florida: Charisma House A Strang Company, 2004.

¹⁰ Charles Ryrie, *The Holy Spirit*, Chicago: Moody Publisher, 1997.

¹¹ Daniel B Wallace, "Greek Grammar and the Personality of the Holy Spirit," *Bulletin for Biblical Research* 13, no. 1 (2003): 97–125.

¹² Andrew David Naselli and Philip R. Gons, "Proof-texting the Personality of the Holy Spirit: An Analysis of the Masculine Demonstrative Pronouns in John 14:26, 15:26, 16:13-14," *Detroit Baptist Seminary Journal* 16 (2011): 65–89.

The pioneers of the Protestant movement, as characterized by Western theology, did not share any intercultural conversation theology approach to this account. They probably have no motivation to explore this discourse in the Asian context. John Owen, as an Anglican figure, works on pneumatology. He deals with the nature and communion of the Spirit.¹³ John Calvin, the theologian of the Holy Spirit,¹⁴ but plays surround the numerical issue of Trinity,¹⁵ deals with the Spirit's personality, relation to believer's life, Christ and scripture. Abraham Kuyper, a Dutch theologian, explores his knowledge of pneumatology¹⁶ but did not share any good topics on systematic-intercultural issues. The following theologian, Kuyper's successor, Herman Bavinck, a Dutch 19th-century reformed theologian, expresses the Spirit's relationship and soteriology.¹⁷ Further, Karl Barth, as a Protestant theologian, discusses the nature of the Spirit and its relation to Trinitarian. In general, Western theology does not articulate the sufficient notion that merits the context of Asian culture,¹⁸ and pneumatology in the context of Western systematic theology does not touch on local issues, and how pneumatology could be an intercultural discussion requires more clarification.

Moreover, churches in Indonesia share a rich of traditions and features. Concerning the Holy Spirit and ancestral spirits in Indonesian Christian traditions, for instance, in Minahasa, the ancestral spirits are considered the highest authority over human beings and express complex faith and the abstraction of ancient religion. The spirit has the authority and power to receive respect and honor.¹⁹ The nature of the spirit is rooted firmly in tribal faith, and, unfortunately, these unbiblical beliefs are retained among local ministers.²⁰ These mean that there should be a solid knowledge of why pneumatology should be an intercultural discussion. Therefore, "this essay focuses on the systematic-intercultural theology approach, which attempts to see how pneumatology is an intercultural discussion that is related and has significance to Indonesian pneumatology. In sum, throughout the Christian scholar's history, reasons for why there should be pneumatology as an intercultural discussion about the Indonesian context are still absent. This research applies Jurgen Moltmann's term to the Spirit, pneumatology, as cinderella theology.²¹ He argued that the Father and Son receive serious exploration while several questions concerning the Spirit, especially the Spirit as an intercultural discussion, are left behind. Therefore, the research question is, how to understand pneumatology as an intercultural discussion that has significance in the Indonesian context? Indeed, pneumatology is an intercultural object, further, it has significant to Indonesian traditions.

METHODS

This research is a qualitative work, attempting to gain relevant resources such as books, articles, journals, and any related works that could help make sense of the pneumatological intercultural discussion. All references will receive special attention through sensitivity

¹³ John Owen, *The Holy Spirit*, R.J.K Law Ed, Edinburgh: Banner of Truth Trust, 1998.

¹⁴ Benjamin B. Warfield, *Calvin and Calvinism*, Publishing House of the M. E Church, 1909.

¹⁵ John Calvin, "Institutes" 1, no. 13 (2017).

¹⁶ Abraham Kuyper, *The Works of the Holy Spirit*, Hendri de Vries Trans, New York: Cosimo Classics, 2007.

¹⁷ Herman Bavinck, *Reformed Dogmatics: Volume 4: Holy Spirit, Church and New Creation*, John Bolt Ed, Grand Rapids MI: Baker Publishing Book, 2008.

¹⁸ Millard J. Erickson, *Christian Theology*, 3rd Ed, Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker, 2013.

¹⁹ N. Graffland, *Minahasa Masa Lampau Dan Masa Kini*, Transl., Joost Kullit, Bandung: Lembaga Perpustakaan Dokumentasi & Informasi, 1986.

²⁰ Suh Sung Min, *Injil Dan Penyembahan Nenek Moyang*, Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo, 2001.

²¹ Jurgen Moltmann, *Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation*, Trans. Margaret Kohl, Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992.

analysis. Afterward, the main idea will be reconstructed by a detailed description, followed by fresh argumentation that is based on all references. Eventually, a solid and valid conclusion will be prepared because of academic experience and the process in this work.

HASIL DAN PEMBAHASAN

Pneumatology is the core and prominent focus in the future.²² Karl Barth in McDonnell's essay considers the Spirit a futuristic discussion that bears significance and importance. Elizabeth A. Dreyer proposes three proposals: Christians' hunger for deep connection with God so that they may engage in bonding fellowship; the church seeks to renew and improve its spirituality; and lastly, theology and philosophy, however, raise confrontation. As a result, she concludes by inviting the Spirit to her lips in these current days.²³ In other words, three organisms in the Christian circle participate in the pneumatology discussion. Similarly speaking, the person, church, and theology incorporate exploring the Spirit's dimensions. Indeed, these triangle subjects play a crucial role in Christian activities; they are in a circle which endless and provokes new discussions over pneumatology in every period. A person would have personal experience that could be distinguished from the church, where theology deals with academic and practical issues. Consequently, the Spirit exists in all squares and prepares futuristic conversations. Veli-Matti Karkkainen insists that pneumatology is a global issue. Its significance, resonance, and wave fill the whole segmentations. "The Spirit is the contact point between the triune God and human being,"²⁴ and reflects mediatorship work as experienced by the Son. The Spirit builds horizontal connection and prepares the encounter stage between Creator and creatures. Indeed, pneumatology shares significance and is weighty.

Unfortunately, Jürgen Moltmann illustrates the Holy Spirit as a *cinderella* theology; the Holy Spirit was left behind while the Father and the Son are enjoying the party.²⁵ Donald J. Gelpi argues that the *theos agraptos* attaches to the Holy Spirit means God without any people's interest, to whom no one writes. Gregory of Nazianzus labels the Spirit as the forgotten God.²⁶ No doubt, the Spirit is a shy member of the Trinity.²⁷ The other divine persons receive exclusive attention and exploration while the Spirit is left behind. It is contradictory to see how pneumatology has significance and weight in the global discussion; it reaches personal human experience and encourages the church to clarify its works; pneumatology is an essential layer in the theological framework but receives no interest. Moltmann indeed considers the Spirit as inferior compared to Christology or the Father, but this is also ironic because the Spirit is God and bears massive theological reflection. Further, the Holy Spirit has been introduced as the *unknown third person* in many cases, a divine person that shares less knowledge with readers.²⁸ It is so because the other divine persons never introduce the Spirit frontally. On the

²² Kilian McDonnell, "A Trinitarian Theology of the Holy Spirit?," *Theological Studies* 46, no. 2 (1985): 193.

²³ Elizabeth A. Dreyer, *An Advent of the Spirit: Medieval Mystics and Saints*, in *Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology*, Ed. Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney, Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2001.

²⁴ Veli-Matti Karkkainen, *PNEUMATOLOGY: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, 2nd Edition, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Academic, 2018.

²⁵ Moltmann, *Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation*, Trans. Margaret Kohl.

²⁶ Donald J. Gelpi, "The Theological Challenge of Charismatic Spirituality," *Pneuma* 14, no. 1 (1992): 185.

²⁷ Frederick Dale Bruner and William Hordern, *The Holy Spirit: Shy Member of the Trinity*, Eugene, Oregon, United States: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2001.

²⁸ Vladimir Lossky, *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*, Crestwood, NY; St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1976.

flip side, the Spirit constantly performs the Father and Son's knowledge.²⁹ Indeed, pneumatology is suffering, lacks attention, and receives underestimation. However, the Spirit's theological sickness should be considered broadly and not limited to the theological dimension alone. Other subjects that have a role in the account are Christians' experiences and church requirements. No doubt, to experience the Spirit as a personal incident, the church that seeks to renew itself and theology with its academic requirements is crucial. To grasp the reasons for the pneumatological deficit, the following considerations should be raised.

First, Christians seek personal experience, which refers to the initiatives of individuals. It is based on personal convictions.³⁰ Pneumatology that has no personal human experience will decrease the Spirit's functions. A stage should be prepared for personal conviction on how people experience the Spirit based on their context. To this degree, Christians will express the Spirit's works, resonances, pieces of knowledge, and significance earned in their practical lives. It is unmeasurable, but that does not make it unexplainable or inexpressible, because everyone has a unique experience. In this sense, Christians reflect on their convictions related to personal life or cultural background." Indeed, the Western traditional expression has specific issues compared to the African or Asian context. Western Christians would perform the Spirit's works that potentially contrast with Eastern Christians' experience. Michael Walker, in his essay, dominantly displays the Spirit's ministry that is always particular and permeates people in various contexts, cultures, and situations.³¹ As in addition, Veli-Matti Karkkainen strictly says that the Spirit's works remain the same. It shares glorification with the Son and fulfills the Father's creation, but the Spirit relates and engages with the person in a precise way.³² As a result, everyone's conviction, experience, and, especially, speaking cultural background plays an important role. All the experiences raised from a cultural situation where causes and effects relate directly to cultural identity are categorized as intercultural. For example, in Western pneumatology, Trinity, soteriology, and other theological themes are prominent discussion topics. The reformed pioneers' movement had personal experience with the Spirit but was distinct from Asian or Indonesian in their context. John Owen, as an Anglican figure, works on pneumatology. He deals with the nature and communion of the Spirit.³³ John Calvin, the theologian of the Holy Spirit,³⁴ expresses his works surrounding the numerical issue of Trinity,³⁵ deals with the Spirit's personality, relation to the believer's life, Christ, and scripture. Abraham Kuyper, a Dutch theologian, explores his knowledge of pneumatology³⁶ but did share topics on a Western theological issue. The following theologian, Kuyper's successor, Herman Bavinck, a Dutch 19th-century reformed theologian, expresses the Spirit's relationship and soteriology.³⁷ Further, Karl Barth, as a Protestant theologian, discusses the nature of the Spirit and its relation to Trinitarian. Western theology does articulate sufficient notions but, in their framework, which is distinct to other

²⁹ D. Lyle Dabney, *Die Kenosis Des Geistes: Kontinuitat Zwischen Schopfung Und Erlösung in Werk Des Heiligen Geistes*, Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1997.

³⁰ Yves Congar, "I Believe in the Holy Spirit, 3 Vols. In One, Trans. David Smith," *New York: Crossroad Herder* 2, no. 152 (1997): 53.

³¹ Michael Welker, *God the Spirit*, Trans. John F. Hoff Meyer, Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994.

³² Veli-Matti Karkkainen, *PNEUMATOLOGY: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, 2nd Edition, Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Academic, 2018.

³³ Owen, *The Holy Spirit*, R.J.K Law Ed.

³⁴ Warfield, *Calvin and Calvinism*.

³⁵ Calvin, "Institutes."

³⁶ Kuyper, *The Works of the Holy Spirit*, Hendri de Vries Trans.

³⁷ Bavinck, *Reformed Dogmatics: Volume 4: Holy Spirit, Church and New Creation*, John Bolt Ed.

cultures and contexts.³⁸ In contrast, for instance, Indonesian Minahasan deals with demonic possession, beliefs of ancestral spirits' existence, and spirits realm, which manifested in cultural rituals. Rikson Karundeng declares that Minahasan ancestral spirits exist and engage in the real world; even more, they still intervene the life in the public square. Several rituals such as *kampetan*, *mumper*, and any related practices are evidence of how ancestral spirits and current society live in coexistence.³⁹ Etymologically, *kampetan* means the possession, possessed ancestral spirits,⁴⁰ and *mumper* expresses how alive Minahasan serves their ancestors or families who passed away with food on the table.⁴¹ In sum, personal conviction and experience truly depend on personal cultural background. A Western Christian must deal with his own culture and pneumatological expression, whereas an Indonesian Christian struggles with local issues. However, the wrong place for pneumatology in a unique culture potentially decreases its significance.

Second, from the church perspective, Veli-Matti Karkkainen suggests that healthy pneumatology should be balanced where the personal experience is earned via church communion, Christian rituals, sacraments, and worships.⁴² Yves Congar offers a balance between personal and institutional principles. The personal principle refers to personal conviction but is led by the church.⁴³ Both principles are inseparable; they should be approached together and displayed in balance. By doing so, healthy pneumatology becomes realistic and reachable. Therefore, the Western church does not match other personal experiences with its features and characteristics. Churches in Indonesia struggle with indigenous convictions, which share distinctions with other churches in the Western or African continent. For instance, the HKBP church in Batak, Indonesia, deals with ancestral spirits' rituals. The church, against any practice that relates to ancestral spirits by giving a new perspective to society, shifts its meaning into a new concept: respect the ancestors.⁴⁴ By doing so, the church allows Christians to participate in rituals and cultural praxis but encourages them to consider it as part of their cultural identity. Christians are free to express their own experience with the spirits. However, Lothar Schreiner raises provoking questions. Is the church thriving in transforming a new identity over the culture and personal experience of the spirits? How does the Christian value of pneumatology knowledge deal with such a phenomenon?⁴⁵ How should the HKBP church test the personal conviction of Christians? Can the HKPB church assess Western Christians' experience of the Spirits? Or how should the Western church consider Christian Batakese's personal experience?

Lastly, Nikos Nissiotis declares that Western Christians have too often caused pneumatology inferiority from the theological perspective. Christianity exclusively refers to Christ where the Spirit is an addition to church activities, even more, in sacraments and

³⁸ Erickson, *Christian Theology*, 3rd Ed.

³⁹ Rikson Karundeng, "Forum Group Discussion."

⁴⁰ Gratciadeo Tumbelaka, Izak Y. M. Lattu, and David Samiyono, "Negosiasi Identitas Kekristenan Dalam Ritual Kampetan Di Watu Pinawetengan Minahasa," *Anthropos: Jurnal Antropologi Sosial dan Budaya (Journal of Social and Cultural Anthropology)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 1.

⁴¹ Denni H.R Pinontoan, "Menuju Teologi Identitas: Kajian Atas Rekonstruksi Dan Representasi Moral Kristen Barat Terhadap Makna Mu'kur Di Minahasa," (Indonesian Journal of Theology vol.3, no.1, 2015).

⁴² Karkkainen, *PNEUMATOLOGY: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, 2nd Edition.

⁴³ Congar, "I Believe in the Holy Spirit, 3 Vols. In One, Trans. David Smith."

⁴⁴ Min, *Injil Dan Penyembahan Nenek Moyang*.

⁴⁵ Lothar Schreiner, *Adat Dan Injil*, Trans. P.S Naipospos, Th. Van Den End & J.S Aritonang, Jakarta: BPK Gunung Mulia, 1994.

ministries.⁴⁶ Vladimir Lossky articulates the superiority of Christ in Western attention; he insists that Christomonism decreases the Spirit's existence.⁴⁷ Hendrikus Berkhof confirms this pneumatological deficit by saying that it is common to portray the Spirit's treatise with a lament articulation.⁴⁸ Further, theological issues such as filioque contribute to destroying the Spirit's conception.⁴⁹ These theological problems lead pneumatology to a hidden place, theological assessment becomes weak, and academic principles are far from the expectation. For instance, in the other doctrines, Christology performs superiority over pneumatology, usually in the Western world. Even more than Christ and the Father, the Spirit withdraws from the surface to mystery himself.⁵⁰ In fact, both personal experience and church official structures should be in balance where theology presents its task to test and try those experiences. Personal experience and conviction about the Spirit alone are not sufficient; it is still incomplete even with the church's help. Here, theology plays its role in discerning such an experience with the Spirit. As interpreted by Joseph Ratzinger, Augustine emphasizes that personal original experience and the church's truth can easily lead to a paradox; therefore, it is prominent to control these experiences that will not be overemphasized.⁵¹ On the other hand, Torajan Christians in Indonesia struggle with their theological conception. *An ancient ceremonial ritual associated with death aims to respect the spirit or soul of someone who has died, including their ancestor spirits, and pass it to the spirit realm.* However, it is also performed as a form of worship for the ancestor spirits.⁵² Besides God or *Puang Matua*, the Torajans consider ancestral spirits as personalities who can perform divine works.⁵³ They believe that Almighty God is equivalent to other spirits. Therefore, the theological challenges are how to define such beliefs that are rooted in the lives of Christian Torajans and how to distinguish between the work of the Holy Spirit and other spirits. Torajan's theological task wrestles with the conception of adoration or tribute. In short, Western theological tradition ignores pneumatological-contextual issues, and worse, the Spirit hides in a very mysterious way that depersonalizes his works, while pneumatology suffers from other issues. It is crucial to explore pneumatology within the non-Western theological framework; the theology itself should be intercultural as personal and church experience, as discussed previously, is always specific to a particular context and shares distinction in its discussion.

However, the lack of personal, church, and theological experience of the Spirit leads to another deficiency, the absence of intercultural-pneumatology concern. Therefore, rational explanations are provided; yet, the intercultural communication gap is the main factor

⁴⁶ Nikos A. Nissiotis, *The Main Ecclesiological Problem of the Second Vatican Council and Position of the Non-Roman Churches Facing It*, *Journal of Ecumenical Studies*, 1965.

⁴⁷ Vladimir Lossky, *In the Image and Likeness of God*, Trans. John H. Erckson and Thomas E. Bird, See Chapter 4. "The Procession of the Holy Spirit in Orthodox Trinitarian Doctrine.," *Crestwood*, NY: St. Valdimir's Seminary Press, 1985.

⁴⁸ Hendrikus Berkhof, *The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit*, Atlanta: John Knox, 1964.

⁴⁹ Bernd Jochen Hilberath, *Identity through Self-Transcendence: The Holy Spirit and Fellowship of Free Persons*, Hinze and Dabney, *Advents of the Spirit*, n.d.

⁵⁰ Joseph Ratzinger, "The Holy Spirit as Communion: Concerning the Relationship of Pneumatology and Spirituality in Augustine," *Communio* 25 (1998): 324.

⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵² Anggun Sri Anggraeni and Gusti Anindya Putri, "MAKNA UPACARA ADAT PEMAKAMAN RAMBU SOLO' DI TANA TORAJA," *Visual Heritage: Jurnal Kreasi Seni dan Budaya* 3, no. 1 (2020).

⁵³ Windrialde Datu Kalua, Femmy C. M. Tasik, and Selvie M. Tumengkol, "TRADISI MA'NENE (PEMBERSIHAN JENAZAH LELUHUR) PADA MASYARAKAT TORAJA: STUDI KASUS DI DESA TONGA RIU KECAMATAN SESEAN SULOARA' KABUPATEN TORAJA UTARA," *HOLISTIK: Journal of Social and Culture* 13, no. 3 (2020): 6.

contributing to pneumatology's inferiority. The intercultural-pneumatological progression is as follows: Christians with needs who long for a closer relationship with God have a different experience of the Spirit; the church, as a Christian community, has a heterogeneous setting; and, finally, theology should base its framework on the necessity of Christians and the church. In other words, the absence of intercultural pneumatology and its triangular engagement causes pneumatology to suffer. Jürgen Moltmann says that "the experience of the Holy Spirit is as specific as the living beings who experience the Spirit, and as varied as the living beings who experience the Spirit are varied."⁵⁴ The Spirit is present but not active in a very specific experience that should be appreciated for its uniqueness.⁵⁵ The Spirit must go beyond a certain context because, as it works in specific ways, it means that it offers various structures, assessments, and experiences. It is correct when Elizabeth A. Dreyer says, "come to Creator Spirit on many lips these days,"⁵⁶ referring to the various contexts in which the Spirit operates. The Spirit relates to each person, church, and theological work in a particular and specific context that goes beyond and out of its own "Western" environment as it will be experienced in distinct cultures.

Indonesian Christians, churches, and theology share diverse experiences compared to the Western world. They struggle and suffer from the belief in ancestors that disrupts their Holy Spirit's experiences in personal and church convictions, even more so with its theological identity. For instance, ancestral spirits are considered the highest authority over human beings. It presents and expresses complex faith and the abstraction of ancient religion in Minahasa. The spirit has the authority and power to receive respect and honor. The spirit has the authority and power to receive respect and honor.⁵⁷ The nature of the spirit is rooted firmly in tribal faith, and, unfortunately, these unbiblical beliefs are retained among local ministers.⁵⁸ It leads to the reality that Christian Minahasan wrestles with the role of the Holy Spirit and ancestral spirits. Moreover, in the Batakese tradition, the ancestral spirit is regarded as the existence of ancestors, a real being able to share protection, blessings, and power. Its personality does manifest in worship rituals. The ancestral spirit is the center of worship, affiliated with the ancient prosperity culture, and is regarded as a supernatural being that deserves adoration. However, contextualization facilitates the old beliefs of local people.⁵⁹ Unfortunately, the impression is that Western theology drives how Indonesians experience the theology itself. The personhood of the Spirit in a systematic approach is considered a Western reflection of Indonesian culture. Consequently, the practice of ancestral spirits and ancestor's beliefs falls victim to syncretism. The Spirit's personality is contextualized in the Western approach, which did not reach the Batakese core issue. Like Minahasan and Batakese, Christian Torajans suffer from intermingling conceptions. However, the existence of souls strongly relates to ancestral spirits and specific indigenous ceremonials. "Aluk To Dolo" and "Rambu Solok" are the existing expressions of Torajan culture concerning ancestral spirits' activities.⁶⁰ Recently, some rituals of *Aluk To Dolo* are forbidden by the church

⁵⁴ Jürgen Moltmann, *The Source of Life: The Holy Spirit and the Theology of Life*, Trans. Margaret Kohl, Minneapolis: Fortress, 1997.

⁵⁵ John R. Sachs, "Do Not Stifle the Spirit: Karl Rahner, the Legacy of Vatican II, and Its Urgency for Theology Today," *Catholic Theological Society of America Proceedings* 51 (1996): 15.

⁵⁶ Dreyer, *An Advent of the Spirit: Medieval Mystics and Saints*, in *Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology*, Ed. Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney.

⁵⁷ Graffland, *Minahasa Masa Lampau Dan Masa Kini*, Transl., Joost Kullit.

⁵⁸ Suh Sung Min, *Injil Dan Penyembahan Nenek Moyang*, Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo, 2001.

⁵⁹ Min, *Injil Dan Penyembahan Nenek Moyang*.

⁶⁰ Roni Ismail, "Ritual Kematian Dalam Agama Asli Toraja 'Aluk To Dolo' (Studi Atas Upacara Kematian Rambu Solok)," *Religi Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama* 15, no. 1 (2019).

community. In contrast, it is considered part of the culture and invites Torajan Christians to participate in its activities.⁶¹ The tension, however, potentially leads to an intense dialogue between pneumatology and the socio-cultural approach. Furthermore, the Spirit's idea must be present as a different contribution to *Aluk To Dolo's* discussion and related rituals. Kathleen Adams has contributed to the resolution of this conflict. Unfortunately, she confines her research to Christian Torajan's perspective on indigenous beliefs, concepts, and practices.⁶² Nonetheless, there is no specific plan or project on pneumatology and ancestral spirits in the Torajan and Batakese context. Indonesian Christians, churches, and theology lack faith and refuse to participate in the Western pneumatological framework. In Indonesia, the personality of ancestral spirits is a challenge that necessitates a healthy pneumatic approach.

CONCLUSION

This project expects to make sense of pneumatology as an intercultural discussion concerning the Indonesian face and preventing pneumatology from being cinderella theology. Accommodating the local tension and issue of each culture are essential. The Holy Spirit's concept could meet the local's order and intention. However, this work does not intend to syncretist, convert, transform, or change the core doctrine of pneumatology. Further, it attempts to portray the urgency of intercultural discussion that relate to the Indonesian context. Nevertheless, a specific plan or project on pneumatology and ancestral spirits in the Torajan context is still absent. Indonesian Christians, churches, and theology have no confidence and do not engage in the Western pneumatological framework. The personality of ancestral spirits is a challenge in Indonesia and requires a healthy pneumatic approach.

REFERENCE

- Adams, Kathleen M. "The Discourse of Souls in Tana Toraja (Indonesia): Indigenous Notions and Christian Conceptions." *Ethnology* 32, no. 1 (1993).
- Anggraeni, Anggun Sri, and Gusti Anindya Putri. "MAKNA UPACARA ADAT PEMAKAMAN RAMBU SOLO' DI TANA TORAJA." *Visual Heritage: Jurnal Kreasi Seni dan Budaya* 3, no. 1 (2020).
- Bavinck, Herman. *Reformed Dogmatics: Volume 4: Holy Spirit, Church and New Creation*, John Bolt Ed. Grand Rapids MI: Baker Publishing Book, 2008.
- Berkhof, Hendrikus. *The Doctrine of the Holy Spirit*. Atlanta: John Knox, 1964.
- Bruner, Frederick Dale, and William Hordern. *The Holy Spirit: Shy Member of the Trinity*. Eugene, Oregon, United States: Wipf and Stock Publishers, 2001.
- Bruneti, Almir C. "The Feast of the Holy Spirit, An Exhibit." *The Latin American Library*. Last modified 1996. <http://lal.tulane.edu/happenings/exhibits/feast-holy-spirit-exhibit>.
- Butarbutar, Rut Debora, and Binsar Jonathan Pakpahan. "Konsep Trinitarian Pneumatologis Sebagai Landasan Teologi Agama-Agama." *Kurios: Jurnal Teologi dan Pendidikan Agama Kristen* 7, no. 2 (2021).
- Calvin, John. "Institutes" 1, no. 13 (2017).
- Congar, Yves. "I Believe in the Holy Spirit, 3 Vols. In One, Trans. David Smith." *New York: Crossroad Herder* 2, no. 152 (1997): 53.
- Dabney, D. Lyle. *Die Kenosis Des Geistes: Kontinuitat Zwischen Schopfung Und Erlösung in Werk Des Heiligen Geistes*. Neukirchen-Vluyn: Neukirchener Verlag, 1997.

⁶¹ Erin Gayatri, "Christian Torajan Youth in Perceiving Aluk To Dolo," *Al-Albab* 7, no. 1 (2018): 100.

⁶² Kathleen M. Adams, "The Discourse of Souls in Tana Toraja (Indonesia): Indigenous Notions and Christian Conceptions," *Ethnology* 32, no. 1 (1993).

- Daneel, M. L. "AFRICAN INDEPENDENT CHURCH PNEUMATOLOGY AND THE SALVATION OF ALL CREATION." *International Review of Mission* 82, no. 326 (April 1993): 143–166. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1758-6631.1993.tb02659.x>.
- Dreyer, Elizabeth A. *An Advent of the Spirit: Medieval Mystics and Saints*, in *Advents of the Spirit: An Introduction to the Current Study of Pneumatology*, Ed. Bradford E. Hinze and D. Lyle Dabney. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press, 2001.
- Erickson, Millard J. *Christian Theology*, 3rd Ed. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Baker, 2013.
- Gayatri, Erin. "Christian Torajan Youth in Perceiving Aluk To Dolo." *Al-Albab* 7, no. 1 (2018): 100.
- Gelpi, Donald J. "The Theological Challenge of Charismatic Spirituality." *Pneuma* 14, no. 1 (1992): 185.
- Graffland, N. *Minahasa Masa Lampau Dan Masa Kini*, Transl., Joost Kullit. Bandung: Lembaga Perpustakaan Dokumentasi & Informasi, 1986.
- Hilberath, Bernd Jochen. *Identity through Self-Transcendence: The Holy Spirit and Fellowship of Free Persons*. Hinze and Dabney, *Advents of the Spirit*, n.d.
- Ismail, Roni. "Ritual Kematian Dalam Agama Asli Toraja 'Aluk To Dolo' (Studi Atas Upacara Kematian Rambu Solok)." *Religi Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama* 15, no. 1 (2019).
- Kalua, Windrialde Datu, Femmy C. M. Tasik, and Selvie M. Tumengkol. "TRADISI MA'NENE (PEMBERSIHAN JENAZAH LELUHUR) PADA MASYARAKAT TORAJA: STUDI KASUS DI DESA TONGA RIU KECAMATAN SESEAN SULOARA' KABUPATEN TORAJA UTARA." *HOLISTIK: Journal of Social and Culture* 13, no. 3 (2020): 6.
- Karkkainen, Veli-Matti. *PNEUMATOLOGY: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, 2nd Edition. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Academic, 2018.
- Karundeng, Rikson. "Forum Group Discussion."
- Kuyper, Abraham. *The Works of the Holy Spirit*, Hendri de Vries Trans. New York: Cosimo Classics, 2007.
- Lak, Yeow Choo. Preface to "Doing Theology with the Spirit's Movement in Asia," Ed. John C. England and Alan J. Torrane. Singapore: ATESEA, 1991.
- Lee, Jung Young. *The Theology of Change: A Christian Concept of God in an Eastern Perspective*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis, 1979.
- Lossky, Vladimir. *In the Image and Likeness of God*, Trans. John H. Erckson and Thomas E. Bird, See Chapter 4. "The Procession of the Holy Spirit in Orthodox Trinitarian Doctrine." Crestwood, NY: St. Valdimir's Seminary Press, 1985.
- — —. *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church*. Crestwood, NY; St. Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1976.
- McDonnel, Kilian. "A Trinitarian Theology of the Holy Spirit?" *Theological Studies* 46, no. 2 (1985): 193.
- Min, Suh Sung. *Injil Dan Penyembahan Nenek Moyang*. Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo, 2001.
- Moltmann, Jurgen. *Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation*, Trans. Margaret Kohl. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992.
- — —. *The Source of Life: The Holy Spirit and the Theology of Life*, Trans. Margaret Kohl. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1997.
- Naselli, Andrew David, and Philip R. Gons. "Proof-texting the Personality of the Holy Spirit: An Analysis of the Masculine Demonstrative Pronouns in John 14:26, 15:26, 16:13-14." *Detroit Baptist Seminary Journal* 16 (2011): 65–89.
- Nissiotis, Nikos A. *The Main Ecclesiological Problem of the Second Vatican Council and Position of the Non-Roman Churches Facing It*. *Journal of Ecumenical Studies*, 1965.
- Owen, John. *The Holy Spirit*, R.J.K Law Ed. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth Trust, 1998.

- Pickett, Fuchsia. *Understanding the Holy Spirit's Personality: The Holy Spirit's Work in You. Florida: Charisma House A Strang Company, 2004.*
- Pinontoan, Denni H.R. "Menuju Teologi Identitas: Kajian Atas Rekonstruksi Dan Representasi Moral Kristen Barat Terhadap Makna Mu'kur Di Minahasa." *Indonesian Journal of Theology* 3, no. 1 (2015): 7.
- Ratzinger, Joseph. "The Holy Spirit as Communio: Concerning the Relationship of Pneumatology and Spirituality in Augustine." *Communio* 25 (1998): 324.
- Rumbay, Charstar Arstilo. "Portraying the Spirit's Personality to Minahasan Christian with Its Ancestral Spirits Tradition Hues." *Religió: Jurnal Studi Agama-agama* 11, no. 1 (March 17, 2021): 114–130. <http://jurnalfuf.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/religio/article/view/1610>.
- Ryrie, Charles. *The Holy Spirit. Chicago: Moody Publisher, 1997.*
- Sachs, John R. "Do Not Stifle the Spirit: Karl Rahner, the Legacy of Vatican II, and Its Urgency for Theology Today." *Catholic Theological Society of America Preceedings* 51 (1996): 15.
- Sandarupa, Stanislaus. "KEBUDAYAAN TORAJA MODAL BANGSA, MILIK DUNIA." *Sosiohumaniora* 16, no. 1 (2014): 5.
- Schreiner, Lothar. *Adat Dan Injil, Trans. P.S Naipospos, Th. Van Den End & J.S Aritonang. Jakarta: BPK Gunung Mulia, 1994.*
- Suparta, I Ketut Gede. "Penggunaan Kata Roh Sang Hyang Pengardi Sebagai Terjemahan Kata Roh Kudus Dalam Alkitab Bahasa Bali." *Jurnal Teologi Kontekstual Indonesia* 2, no. 2 (March 2, 2022): 27. <https://journal.sttsimpson.ac.id/index.php/JTKI/article/view/501>.
- Tumbelaka, Gratciadeo, Izak Y. M. Lattu, and David Samiyono. "Negosiasi Identitas Kekristenan Dalam Ritual Kompetan Di Watu Pinawetengan Minahasa." *Anthropos: Jurnal Antropologi Sosial dan Budaya (Journal of Social and Cultural Anthropology)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 1.
- Wallace, Daniel B. "Greek Grammar and the Personality of the Holy Spirit." *Bulletin for Biblical Research* 13, no. 1 (2003): 97–125.
- Warfield, Benjamin B. *Calvin and Calvinism. Publishing House of the M. E Church, 1909.*
- Welker, Michael. *God the Spirit, Trans. John F. Hoff Meyer. Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994.*
- Yung, Hwa. *Mangoes or Bananas? The Quest for an Authentic Asian Christian Theology, Regnum Studies in Mission. Oxford: Regnum, 1997.*